ANGEWANDTE CHEMIE
INTERNATIONAL EDITION
A Journal of the Gesellschaft Deutscher Chemiker
2002
41/13
Pages 2209 – 2422

EDITORIAL

And Hückel Was Correct After All—A Withdrawal and an Apology

In the second April issue (No. 8, pp. 1429–1431) this year we published a communication from J. B. Lambert et al. in which an astonishingly stable salt of the pentamethylcyclopentadienyl cation was reported. Following the Hückel rule this antiaromatic cation should, in fact, be highly unstable, and for decades attempts at its preparation and definite characterization have failed—however, perhaps this time the counterion, tetrakis(pentafluorophenyl)borate, had worked wonders. In any case, after two rounds of refereeing by three experts the communication was accepted, and, following publication (April 15) naturally caused quite a stir. Unfortunately, it must now be said that the experimental results were incorrectly interpreted, which was quickly discovered. On April 22, G. Bertrand and co-workers submitted a manuscript in which they showed that the species generated by Lambert et al. was, in fact, a pentamethylcyclopentenyl cation. To keep damage to a minimum we published this manuscript as fast as possible (on May 7) on the *Angewandte Chemie* homepage, following refereeing by those experts who had evaluated the Lambert et al. communication, and after giving J. B. Lambert the opportunity to comment, which resulted in his co-authorship. The edited version of this manuscript can be found in this issue (p. 2275 ff), together with a short theoretical treatment by T. Müller (p. 2276 ff), as well as a "statement" from J. B. Lambert (p. 2279).

As the Editor I regret that we did not examine the original manuscript more critically, and that its publication has resulted in unnecessary work to reproduce the results experimentally and theoretically.

Dr. Peter Gölitz

  1433-7851/02/4113-2211 $ 20.00+.50/0